

CITY OF MURFREESBORO
HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

Regular Meeting December 18, 2018
3:30 PM, Council Chambers, City Hall

- I. Call to Order and determination of a quorum
- II. Approve Minutes of the Regular Meeting on June 19, 2018
- III. New Business
 - **H-18-003 – 450 E Main Street, request to demolish 2 existing accessory structures and to demolish or relocate an existing smaller home located to the rear of the main house.**
 - **Historic Zoning Commission Calendar 2019**
- IV. Staff Reports and Other Business
- V. Adjourn

**City of Murfreesboro
Historic Zoning Commission
Staff Comments**

III. New Business:

H-18-003 –450 E Main Street, request to demolish and/or remove 2 existing accessory structures and an existing smaller home located to the rear of the main house

This property encompasses the block from East Main, running along Highland and the corner of Vine Street, approximately 1.3 acres. This property is owned by Bert and Katie McCarter. The long range plan for the property is to add a downstairs master suite, pool house, pool and patio areas. A second application will come to the historic zoning commission after the decision is rendered concerning the removal of the yellow home and the two accessory structures.

450 E Main Street - Main Home

The main house is a 7,000 square foot, brick, two story home in the Colonial Revival/ Neoclassical style. It was designed by Fletcher and Billis Architects in 1911 for the Darrow Family. The main home has undergone numerous interior renovations. An enclosed porch, carport and patio spaces have been added to the exterior of the home over time. This is not an application to alter the main home.

The main house is a contributing structure in the East Main Street Historic District of the National Register of Historic Places and the E Main Street Local Designation.

The three structures in question are located towards Vine Street, two accessory buildings and one smaller home.

One -Story Brick Structure (applicant desires to demolish structure)

Structure may have originally been constructed as a small garage or carriage house for the main house. A single story, brick addition was added to the original structure at some point but the addition was not part of the original structure (brick and mortar do not match that of original). The south end of the building is vinyl siding with a painted textured board veneer at the gable. The brick and foundation have numerous cracks and patches. The original openings have been altered. The building is currently abandoned.

One-Story White Vinyl Siding Structure (applicant desires to demolish structure)

This is a vinyl clad storage building. It was likely constructed in the 1980's and has no historical significance.

116 S Highland One-Story Yellow Siding Wood Framed Home (applicant wishes to demolish but would be willing to let someone move the structure)

This home currently sits at the corner of S Highland Avenue and East Vine Street to the rear of 450 E Main Street. The structure was built around 1870. It is a one story home, Vernacular, Italianate arched porch, brackets, gable roof.

The home is listed as a contributing structure in the East Main Street Historic District of the National Register of Historic Places and the E Main Street Local Designation.

The home was moved to this location somewhere between 1907 and 1914 based on Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps information. There is no information in the applicant stating where the structure was moved from or the original date of construction. In discussion with local experts it is generally believed the structure was originally located at 450 E Main Street, where the larger home now sits.

A home inspection has been completed and is attached to the application. The report state the foundation and roof structure require significant repairs. The interior of the building has been subdivided and no longer retains its historical character. The exterior has been covered with asbestos siding and some the original details of the home are rotting and in poor condition. Visually it appears the decorative accoutrements of the front patio are in good repair. Transom windows located at the front entrance appear to be in good repair. Staff is not aware of what in the interior is original and in good repair.

The Historic District Guidelines state the demolition is appropriate when:

1. A building has lost its architectural and historical integrity and importance and its removal will not result in a more negative, less appropriate visual effect on the District.
2. A building does not contribute to the historical or architectural character and importance of the district and its removal will result in a more positive, appropriate visual effect on the District.
3. The denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the Commission in accordance with the Historic Zoning Ordinance.

The Historic District Guidelines state a building may be removed from one site to another in the District when:

1. The integrity of location and setting of the building in its original location has been lost or is seriously threatened.
2. The new location will be similar in setting and siting.
3. The building will be compatible with the buildings adjacent to the new location in style, height, scale, materials and setback.

4. The relocation of the building will not result in a negative visual effect on the site and surrounding buildings from which it will be removed.

Neighborhood context photographs, as well as photographs of the home, have been submitted by the applicant for the Commission's review. The applicants will be in attendance at the meeting in order to answer any questions the Commission may have regarding the request.

The Historic Zoning Commission Rules of Procedure

IV. ECONOMIC HARDSHIPS

A. Approval of Removal or Demolition:

In the event an application for removal or demolition of a building or other structure within a District is submitted or such demolition is required, the government agency receiving such request or initiating such action shall transmit a copy thereof to the Commission and said Commission shall have a period of thirty (30) days from the date the application was filed to act upon the application. Upon failure of the Commission to take final action within thirty (30) days following the availability of the required data, the case shall be deemed approved, except when mutual agreement has been made for an extension of the time limit.

B. Determination of Economic Hardship:

Each application for removal or demolition shall be considered, taking into account economic hardship. The Commission may, after reasonable notice, set an application for public hearing and may consider any or all of the following:

1. Estimate of the cost of the proposed redevelopment, alteration, demolition, or removal and an estimate of any additional cost that would be incurred to comply with the recommendations of the Commission for changes necessary for the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
2. A report from a licensed engineer or architect with experience in rehabilitation as to the structural soundness of any structures on the property and their suitability for rehabilitation.
3. Estimated market value of the property in its current condition; after completion of the proposed redevelopment, alteration, demolition or removal; after any changes recommended by the Commission; and, in the case of a proposed demolition, after renovation of the existing property.
4. In the case of a proposed demolition, an estimate from an architect, developer, real estate consultant, appraiser, or other real estate professional experienced in rehabilitation as to the economic feasibility of rehabilitation or reuse of the existing structure on the property.
5. Amount paid for the property, the date of purchase, and the party from whom purchased, including a description of the relationship, if any, between the owner of record or applicant and the person from whom the property was purchased, and any terms of financing between the seller and buyer.

6. If the property is income-producing, the annual gross income from the property for the previous two (2) years, itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous two (2) years; and depreciation deduction and annual cash flow before and after debt service, if any, during the same period.
7. Any other information considered necessary by the
8. Commission to a determination as to whether the property does yield or may yield a reasonable return to the owners. Request for consideration shall be taken up at a public hearing with reasonable notice and consideration given to any or all the factors listed above.